

SUGGESTED SOLUTION

CA INTERMEDIATE

SUBJECT- AUDIT

Test Code - CIM 8456

BRANCH - () (Date:)

Head Office: Shraddha, 3rd Floor, Near Chinai College, Andheri (E), Mumbai – 69.

Tel: (022) 26836666

ANSWER-1

ANSWER-A

As per SA 210 Acceptance of a Change in Engagement: An auditor who, before the completion of the engagement, is requested to change the engagement to one which provides a lower level of assurance, should consider the appropriateness of doing so.

A request from the client for the auditor to change the engagement may result from a change in circumstances affecting the need for the service, a misunderstanding as to the nature of an audit or related service originally requested or a restriction on the scope of the engagement, whether imposed by management or caused by circumstances. The auditor would consider carefully the reason given for the request, particularly the implications of a restriction on the scope of the engagement, especially any legal or contractual implications.

If the auditor concludes that there is reasonable justification to change the engagement and if the audit work performed complied with the SAs applicable to the changed engagement, the report issued would be appropriate for the revised terms of engagement. In order to avoid confusion, the report would not include reference to-

- (i) the original engagement; or
- (ii) any procedures that may have been performed in the original engagement, except where the engagement is changed to an engagement to undertake agreed-upon procedures and thus reference to the procedures performed is a normal part of the report.

The auditor should not agree to a change of engagement where there is no reasonable justification for doing so.

If the terms of the audit engagement are changed, the auditor and management shall agree on and record the new terms of the engagement in an engagement letter or other suitable form of written agreement.

If the auditor is unable to agree to a change of the terms of the audit engagement and is not permitted by management to continue the original audit engagement, the auditor shall-

- (i) Withdraw from the audit engagement where possible under applicable law or regulation; and
- (ii) Determine whether there is any obligation, either contractual or otherwise, to report the circumstances to other parties, such as those charged with governance, owners or regulators.

(6 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

A "Government company" (as defined under Companies Act , 2013) is a company in which not less than 51% of the paid-up share capital is held by the Central Government or by any State Government or Governments or partly by the Central Government and partly by one or more State Governments, and includes a company which is a subsidiary company of such a Government company.

Section 139(7) of Companies Act , 2013 provides that in the case of a Government company or any other company owned or controlled, directly or indirectly, by the Central Government, or by any State Government, or Governments, or partly by the Central Government and partly by one or more State Governments, the first auditor shall be appointed by the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India within 60 days from the date of registration of the company.

In case the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India does not appoint such auditor within the above said period, the Board of Directors of the company shall appoint such auditor within the next 30 days. Further, in the case of failure of the Board to appoint such auditor within next 30 days, it shall inform the members of the company who shall appoint such auditor within 60 days at an extraordinary general meeting. Auditors shall hold office till the conclusion of the first annual general meeting.

(3 MARKS)

Hence, in the case of Bhartiya Petrol Ltd., being a government company, the first auditor shall be appointed by the Comptroller and Auditor General of India.

Conclusion: Thus, the appointment of first auditor made by the Board of Directors of Bhartiya Petrol Ltd., is null and void.

(1 MARK)

ANSWER-2

ANSWER-A

The Chartered Accountant has a responsibility to remain independent by taking into account the context in which they practice, the threats to independence and the safeguards available to eliminate the threats.

The following are the guiding principles in this regard: -

- 1. For the public to have confidence in the quality of audit, it is essential that auditors should always be and appears to be independent of the entities that they are auditing.
- 2. In the case of audit, the key fundamental principles are integrity, objectivity and professional skepticism, which necessarily require the auditor to be independent.
- 3. Before taking on any work, an auditor must conscientiously consider whether it involves threats to his independence.
- 4. When such threats exist, the auditor should either desist from the task or put in place safeguards that eliminate them.
- 5. If the auditor is unable to fully implement credible and adequate safeguards, then he must not accept the work.

(5*1 = 5 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

Joint Audit: The practice of appointing Chartered Accountants as joint auditors is quite widespread in big companies and corporations. Joint audit basically implies pooling together the resources and expertise of more than one firm of auditors to render an expert job in a given time period which may be difficult to accomplish acting individually. It essentially involves sharing of the total work. This is by itself a great advantage.

In specific terms the **advantages** that flow may be the following:

- (i) Sharing of expertise.
- (ii) Advantage of mutual consultation.
- (iii) Lower workload.
- (iv) Better quality of performance.
- (v) Improved service to the client.
- (vi) Displacement of the auditor of the company taken over in a takeover often obviated.
- (vii) In respect of multi-national companies, the work can be spread using the expertise of the local firms which are in a better position to deal with detailed work and the local laws and regulations.
- (viii) Lower staff development costs.
- (ix) Lower costs to carry out the work.
- (x) A sense of healthy competition towards a better performance

(10*0.5 = 5 MARKS)

ANSWER-3

ANSWER-A

As per SA-200 "Overall Objectives of the Independent Auditor", in conducting an audit of financial statements, the overall objectives of the auditor are:

- (a) To obtain reasonable assurance about whether the financial statements as a whole are free from material misstatement; and
- (b) To report on the financial statements, and communicate as required by the SAs, in accordance with the auditor's findings.

Timeliness of Financial Reporting and the Balance between Benefit and Cost: The matter of difficulty, time, or cost involved is not in itself a valid basis for the auditor to omit an audit procedure for which there is no alternative or to be satisfied with audit evidence that is less than persuasive. Appropriate planning assists in making sufficient time and resources available for the conduct of the audit. Notwithstanding this, the relevance of information, and thereby its value, tends to diminish over time, and there is a balance to be struck between the reliability of information and its cost. There is an expectation by users of financial statements that the auditor will form an opinion on the financial statements within a reasonable period of time and at a reasonable cost, recognizing that it is impracticable to address all information that may exist or to pursue every matter exhaustively on the assumption that information is in error or fraudulent until proved otherwise.

(4 MARKS)

ANSWER-B

Matters to be included in the auditor's report- statutory dues and repayment of loans or borrowing to a financial institution, bank, Government or dues to debenture holders (CARO, 2016)—

Clause (vii) (a) whether the company is regular in depositing undisputed statutory dues including provident fund, employees' state insurance, income-tax, sales-tax, service tax, duty of

customs, duty of excise, value added tax, cess and any other statutory dues with the appropriate authorities and if not, the extent of the arrears of outstanding statutory dues as at the last day of the financial year concerned for a period of more than six months from the date they became payable, shall be indicated;

(b) where dues of income tax or sales tax or service tax or duty of customs or duty of excise or value added tax have not been deposited on account of any dispute, then the amounts involved and the forum where dispute is pending shall be mentioned. (A mere representation to the concerned Department shall not constitute a dispute).

Clause (viii) whether the company has defaulted in repayment of loans or borrowing to a financial institution, bank, Government or dues to debenture holders? If yes, the period and the amount of default to be reported (in case of defaults to banks, financial institutions, and Government, lender wise details to be provided).

(6 MARKS)

ANSWER-4

ANSWER-A

As per section 141(3)(d)(i), a person shall not be eligible for appointment as an auditor of a company, who, or his relative or partner is holding any security of or interest in the company or its subsidiary, or of its holding or associate company or a subsidiary of such holding company. However, as per proviso to this section, the relative of the person may hold the securities or interest in the company of face value not exceeding of Rs.1,00,000.

In the instant case, M/s RM & Co. is an audit firm having partners CA. R and CA. M. Mr. Bee is a relative of CA. R and he is holding shares of Enn Ltd. of face value of Rs. 50,000 only (5,000 shares x Rs. 10 per share).

(2 MARKS)

Therefore, M/s RM & Co. is not disqualified for appointment as an auditors of Enn Ltd. as the relative of CA. R (i.e. partner of M/s RM &Co.) is holding the securities in Enn Ltd. which is within the limit mentioned in proviso to section 141(3)(d)(i) of the Companies Act,2013.

(1 MARK)

ANSWER-B

Information which assist the Auditor in accepting and continuing of relationship with Client: As per SA 220, "Quality Control for an Audit of Financial Statements" the auditor should obtain information considered necessary in the circumstances before accepting an engagement with a new client, when deciding whether to continue an existing engagement and when considering acceptance of a new engagement with an existing client. The following information would assist the auditor in accepting and continuing of relationship with the client:

- (i) The integrity of the principal owners, key management and those charged with governance of the entity;
- (ii) Whether the engagement team is competent to perform the audit engagement and has the necessary capabilities, including time and resources;
- (iii) Whether the firm and the engagement team can comply with relevant ethical requirements; and

(iv) Significant matters that have arisen during the current or previous audit engagement, and their implications for continuing the relationship.

(4*1 = 4 MARKS)

ANSWER-C

As per Section 143 (2) of Companies Act , 2013 Right to report to the members of the company on the accounts examined by him - The auditor shall make a report to the members of the company on the accounts examined by him and on every financial statements which are required by or under this Act to be laid before the company in general meeting and the report shall after taking into account the provisions of this Act, the accounting and auditing standards and matters which are required to be included in the audit report under the provisions of this Act or any rules made there under or under any order made under this section and to the best of his information and knowledge, the said accounts, financial statements give a true and fair view of the state of the company's affairs as at the end of its financial year and profit or loss and cash flow for the year and such other matters as may be prescribed.

(3 MARKS)

ANSWER-5

- 1. A
- 2. D
- 3. C
- 4. C
- 5. C
- 6. D
- 7. C